SANTA CLARA CITY PLANNING COMMISSION
MEETING MINUTES
2603 Santa Clara Drive
Thursday, June 13, 2019

Present: Michael Day, Vice Chair
James Call
Jason Lindsey
Leina Mathis
Mark Weston
Marv Wilson

Staff: Corey Bundy, Community Development Director
Bob Nicholson, City Planner
Devin Snow, City Attorney
Selena Nez, Planning Commission Secretary

Excused: Curtis Jensen
Mark Hendrickson

1. **Call to Order.**

   In the absence of Chair Curtis Jensen, Vice Chair, Michael Day called the meeting to order at 5:36 p.m.

2. **Opening Ceremony.**

   Mark Weston led the Pledge of Allegiance and offered the invocation.

3. **Communications and Appearances.**

   A. **General Citizen Communication.**

      There were no citizen comments.

4. **Working Agenda:**

   A. **Public Hearings.**

      1. **Public Hearing to Receive Input to Consider a Request to Amend the Santa Clara City General Plan Land Use Map to Allow for Proposed Clustered Housing Project with an 18-Hole Golf Course, Trail, and Open Space on Approximately 298 Acres Located West of the Present Entrada Development and Generally Between Pioneer Parkway on the South and Snow Canyon Parkway to the North, Patrick Manning, Applicant.**

      City Planner, Bob Nicholson presented the staff report and stated that the proposed project consists of approximately 600 acres that are split between Ivins and Santa Clara. 298 acres are in Santa Clara
City boundaries and the balance is primarily in Ivins with a portion in St. George. An 18-hole golf course is proposed as well as a resort hotel, and clustered housing pods. The site map was displayed. Currently, the main road that accesses the property is Pioneer Parkway. Two future roads also bisect the property. The purpose of the General Plan is to serve as a blueprint for future development and a guide for future zoning decisions. The property is currently zoned Planned Development Residential, which was zoned in 2007 for the Knolls Pasture project. The plan is no longer viable. What is proposed is a replacement project.

The applicant, Split Rock Development, was represented by Patrick Manning. The application identified the overall density to be approximately 6.5 units per acre overall, which translates to 1,937 units. Utility capacity was not expected to be an issue. A major issue associated with the project is lava fields preservation. The City’s General Plan addresses lava fields as well as other sensitive areas that should be preserved. Mr. Nicholson referred to Policy 9.6 of the City’s General Plan, which states that the City will encourage development in lava fields to retain a minimum of 50% of the beds intact and specifically preserve the ridges and visible high points.

Mr. Nicholson explained that some of the areas in the project area have already been disturbed and the area has been used as a lava harvesting area for several years. A photo of Area 6 was displayed that runs along Pioneer Parkway. Because the area is so visible, it is important to preserve. With regard to public trails, a network was proposed through the lava beds. Details relative to the design of the housing units will be submitted with the zoning application. Tonight’s discussion will address general concepts.

James Call asked about the history and reasoning behind the public trail. Mr. Nicholson stated that Brent Beasley authorized the trails becoming public. Marv Wilson was involved with the trail in 1995 and 1996 and at the time the City owned the property. When it was sold, the alignment was to remain intact.

The Santa Clara City boundaries were identified. The boundary adjustment the City was working on with Ivins in Area 9 was identified as well. Mr. Nicholson explained that a public hearing will be held in August on six acres that the applicants have requested be transferred into Ivins for sewer service. Various boundary adjustments were proposed based on utility service ability.

Mr. Nicholson identified the plan that is in place currently for the same area. What was presented is the conceptual layout and the basis for future zoning requests. The City has the discretion to do what they feel is best based on the General Plan.

Mark Weston asked where the clubhouse will be located. He also identified a five-acre parcel between Areas 4 and 6 that is not owned by the developers. He asked if the owners will be granted access through the property.

Community Development Director, Corey Bundy identified on the map displayed where JP Excavation has been working. Chair Day commented on the colored areas on the map and stated that the General Plan Map is based on what was expected to occur with the Knolls Pasture development. The use was anticipated to be low-density. The area shown in orange was to be medium-density.

The applicant, Patrick Manning reported that the vision began over 20 years ago with Entrada being the first phase and the Black Desert Resort at Entrada being the second. They envisioned the project
to be open and inclusive with retail and no gates. The only area they intend to gate is where they will be protecting 240 acres of lava. In Area 6 they also intend to take precautions to preserve the most prominent lava features. If they do not build in Area 6, they will likely not go to the expense of moving the power lines, which will be an improvement overall to the City. They also plan to plant large trees in areas where there are scars.

Mr. Manning stated that a clubhouse is not proposed since it is a resort type project. He informed Ivins City officials that they intend to have their pro shop based in Ivins; however, because half of the golf course is in Santa Clara, they are promoting a revenue share. The conversation was ongoing. The applicants were hesitantly prepared to have two pro shops. Mr. Manning referred a new map and identified the proposed changes.

Michael Day asked about the public trails and if they will be fully public. Mr. Manning explained that they intend for the project to be inclusive. Along the western corridor they plan to locate trailheads and parking areas. He stressed that there will be no restrictions on use.

Michael Day asked about the size of the area shown in blue. Mr. Manning stated that it consists of about 19 acres.

Marv Wilson inquired about Area 6 and the desire to protect the lava flows. He commented that it is a unique area for lava but the City trail goes through it. In order to support the proposal, he would need a compelling vision of what would be required to allow Area 6 to be disturbed. Mr. Manning stated that there had been some discussion about moving the trail so that it is less windy and so that there is not such a steep climb in one particular area. Either way, the area lends itself well to the clustered low-density housing. Their intent is to develop in areas that are the least attractive. Mr. Manning noted that they share the same sensitivities as the City and their intent is to preserve the most important features of the lava flow.

Marv Wilson inquired about the vision for the transmission lines. Mr. Manning stated that currently they crisscross Pioneer Parkway. The lava flow on the north side of the parkway is quite a bit higher than the south side. The intent would be to move the 11 poles from the north side to the lower side on City-owned property so that they are less visually intrusive. Marv Wilson recalled that the power lines went in around 1995 and were rather controversial. At the time it was not common to go through lava and was very difficult.

With regard to the golf course, Mr. Manning stated that it will not be membership-driven but will be resort private and not open to the public.

Chair Day opened the public hearing.

James Call asked if an easement is associated with the trail. City Attorney, Devin Snow was not aware of one but offered to look into it.

Dyle Bond gave his address as 2255 Jacob Drive and asked if Pioneer Parkway will be widened in the process of construction. He also asked if the hotel will be limited to two stories and comply with the current height requirements. Mark Weston explained that the clustered housing will include construction in specific areas and leave large areas of green space. Mr. Nicholson stated that the clustered housing could include attached units but it does not have to. The sizes of the homes will be
addressed with the zoning issues. Mr. Bond asked about gated areas within the project. Mr. Nicholson stated that the gated areas will be within the Ivins City boundaries.

Dan Brown, an Ivins resident, enjoyed the beauty of the area and moved from Seattle. He has visited Entrada and was pleased to hear that they were involved with the project. He expressed his support.

Barbara Mitchell, an Ivins resident, reported that she lives in the Reserve in Entrada. She asked how the project will be developed with two cities involved. She was aware that Ivins is strongly in favor of upholding the Night Sky Initiative but had not heard the same about Santa Clara. She asked about the height restriction for commercial. In Entrada they are at 14 feet and she would not want to see a multi-story hotel developed.

Chair Day stated that each city will have their own requirements that will have to be adhered to. There is not yet a development plan in place to address how the project will move forward. The details will be reviewed in the future. Mr. Nicholson noted that Ivins and Santa Clara have a long history of working together. Santa Clara supports the idea of protecting the night sky. With regard to hotel height, the hotel site location is considerably lower than the surrounding property and will not project above the skyline.

Mr. Manning remarked that they are typically more restrictive than the ordinances allow and there will be consistency between the two projects. Features of the site were described. In terms of the two cities working together, they have reached out to key staff to address how the roads will connect. Details with regard to height had not yet been addressed.

Dustin Caplin shared the concerns mentioned about Area 6 and the lava beds. He reported that he lives in the Blackhawk Townhomes and would not want to lose his view. He also expressed concern about the height of the hotel.

Ms. Mitchell asked if the homes will be single-family residences or nightly rentals. Chair Day indicated that they do not have a specific plan. Mr. Manning stated that there will be an overnight rental component because of the hotel use. No other details were available.

Jan Caplin reported that she and her husband moved to the area 20 years ago. What attracted them to Santa Clara was the small town, friendly, safe atmosphere. She understood the need for growth but they have watched vacation rentals and other uses detract from the small town feel. She saw no need for a hotel and urged the Commission to not automatically approve it. Consideration should be given to the traffic and people it will generate. She also questioned the availability of water.

Mr. Manning commented that some of the most important lava features to the residents of Santa Clara are actually in the City of Ivins.

There were no further public comments. The public hearing was closed.

B. General Business.

1. Appointment of New Planning Commission Chairman.

Chair Day reported that Curtis Jensen’s term has expired so a new Chair needs to be appointed. It
was noted that Michael Day’s term was to expire in the coming months. It was suggested that Leina Mathis be nominated to serve as Chair. It was noted, however, that she is running for a position on the City Council. She considered serving as Chair to be a win-win situation since she enjoys serving on the Planning Commission. Chair Day agreed to continue to serve as Vice Chair.

James Call moved to appoint Leina Mathis as Planning Commission Chairman with Michael Day continuing to serve as Vice Chair until the outcome of the upcoming election is known. Marv Wilson seconded the motion. The motion passed with the unanimous consent of the Commission.

2. **Recommendation to City Council to Consider a Request to Amend the Santa Clara City General Plan Land Use Map to Allow for Proposed Clustered Housing Project with an 18-Hole Golf Course, Hotel, Trail, and Open Space on Approximately 298 Acres located West of the Present Entrada Development and Generally between Pioneer Parkway on the South and Snow Canyon Parkway to the North, Patrick Manning, Applicant.**

In response to a question raised, Mr. Bundy indicated that he was not aware of any plans to widen Pioneer Parkway. Commissioner Weston asked Public Works Director, Jack Taylor about it 18 months earlier and he doubted it would ever be done because of the expense of going through the lava beds. The hope was that at some point the traffic will go elsewhere.

Marv Wilson reported that his firm was involved in the Traffic Master Plan and he recalled that it may have involved adding one lane in the next 20 years. He indicated that it will have to be widened if there is access off of it.

James Call mentioned that a comment was made that the City of St. George had no interest in widening their portion of Pioneer Parkway. He recalled hearing a comment that widening does not always allow more traffic and simply enables it to go faster. As a result, he was averse to widening it.

Traffic circulation and access issues were discussed. Marv Wilson thought the proposed project would be a great addition to the community and he was pleased to see that the commercial areas will be hidden. He was not sure about the gated component but recognized that it is in Ivins. In terms of Area 6, he had reservations. Mr. Manning indicated that they never intended to eliminate the trail. If anything, they would move it so that it is more conducive to the lay of the land and development.

Jason Lindsey asked about the ownership of the new golf course and if it would be affiliated with Entrada. Mr. Manning explained that the golf course at Entrada is owned by the equity members. He stressed their commitment, which includes a five-year operational shortfall of 100% meaning zero revenue on the hotel and the golf course. The anticipated development timeframe was 18 months for the golf course.

Leina Mathis confirmed that the major feature will be the golf course to attract visitors. Mr. Manning explained that the idea for the first phase will likely be the golf course.
Water sources were identified. Mr. Manning stated that St. George will bring water to them from Gunlock Reservoir. A two-acre lake will be constructed from which they can draw their 450 acre-feet of water.

Jason Lindsey pointed out that the current zoning is Planned Development Residential. Mr. Nicholson explained that the concept plan becomes the zone. It was noted that Knolls Pasture included a golf course and was a master development.

Potential motion language was discussed. Mr. Snow stated that it could be in accordance with the concept map and any other amendments the Commission chooses to propose.

Jason Lindsey asked what the developer was willing to negotiate for Area 6. Mr. Manning responded that in the future he would assume a recommendation for approval would include a condition that the City Council would view Area 6 with great concern. The developer would have to deal with the issue and would be made aware that it is a sensitive area. Commissioner Lindsey asked if prohibiting future changes to the trail would create issues for the developer. Mr. Manning stated that it would not but it would not preclude them from presenting a plan at a later date for consideration.

With regard to the transmission lines, moving them would perhaps require Pioneer Parkway to potentially be closed. He questioned who would be responsible to move them. Mr. Manning stated that the City would move them across the street where the elevation is lower. Mr. Nicholson commented that one option would be recommend approval of the plan but temporarily defer Area 6 until a more specific concept plan is received.

James Call liked the project but had a personal interest in the lava flow. Jason Lindsey agreed with Mr. Brown that everything Entrada has done has been very high quality. He expected this to be a very desirable project.

Commissioner Wilson moved to recommend approval to the City Council of a request to amend the Santa Clara City General Plan Land Use Map to allow for a proposed clustered housing project with an 18-hole golf course, hotel, trail, and open space, as presented, with the exclusion of Area 6. The developers could come back later with a plan for Area 6. Commissioner Call seconded the motion. The motion passed with the unanimous consent of the Commission.

3. Recommendation to City Council to Consider a Request Approval for Amended Preliminary Plat for the Sycamores at Santa Clara Phase 1B, Kyle Hafen, Representing.

Mr. Bundy presented the staff report and stated that the project consists of a 27-acre 36-lot family subdivision on approximately 27 acres. The property is zoned R-1-10 and is located east of Gates Lane and south of the Santa Clara River. The majority of the property contains slopes less than 15%, however, Lots 31 and 36 extend up the hill and have slopes of 25 to 40 percent. The wash is located between Lots 34 and 35 and extends south up the slope. The wash is a significant drainage area and the applicant proposes to create a detention basin immediately south of Lot 34. The detention basin storm water will be piped underground along the public street near the Santa Clara River where the storm water will enter the river. The Hillside Review Board met twice in August of 2015 and recommended approval with conditions.
To protect the subdivision against flooding and erosion, the developer placed rip rap along Lots 1 through 9. The 100-year flood plain runs through Lots 3 through 9. An easement for flood control maintenance and trails is planned along the south side of the Santa Clara River. The applicant approached the City and indicated that they were refinancing the property, however, the bank noticed in the approval process of Phase 1A that the approval of the preliminary plat was subject to (1) a revised drainage report; (2) a Flood Plain Development Permit, and (3) an Erosion Hazard Study. The preliminary plat for 1A included the erosion hazard along the river. The developers stockpiled the two lots with erosion hazard material and will complete the work prior to final plat approval. They were asking for a revised final plat that specifies that City improvements will be installed with the exclusion of the erosion hazard and clarify that City improvements will be installed prior to final plat approval.

**Commissioner Lindsey moved to recommend approval to the City Council of the amendment to the Preliminary Plat for the Sycamores, as described by staff and as noted on the preliminary plat. Commissioner Mathis seconded the motion.**

The motion was clarified and it was recognized that the Hillside Review Board has not approved Lots 35 and 36. Procedural issues were discussed.

**The motion passed with the unanimous consent of the Commission.**

5. Discussion Items.

Mr. Bundy reported that an applicant came before the Technical Review Committee (TRC) requesting construction of Jim’s RV. The TRC looked at the commercial zone, which allows athletic and sporting goods stores as a permitted use, excluding the sale and repair of motor vehicles, motorboats, and off-street vehicles and motorized vehicles. There was some question as to whether the desire was to have a repair type of business along Santa Clara Drive. The commercial zone also specifies that other uses as may be determined that are in harmony with the character and intent of the zone may be approved. The applicant purchased the property and would like to construct a 300’ x 8’ wall along Arrowhead Trail. Staff asked for direction on what the Commission feels would be appropriate for that location along Santa Clara Drive.

The Contractor, Doug Rogers read a letter from the owner that indicated that Jim’s RV Service is a small, family-owned and operated store that has been in business in the same location on Sunset Boulevard for 30 years. They perform appliance, electrical, roofing, and minor body repairs. The new facility will accommodate all the work being done inside a climate-controlled building. They do not perform work to the chassis or engine. The family was pleased with the prospect of moving into a new facility.

Jason Lindsey asked if the intention would be to have access onto Arrowhead Trail. Mr. Rogers stated that that was not an option. Mr. Bundy stated that the determination was whether it is a permitted use after which time it would come back in July for site plan approval. The property is zoned commercial and the commercial standards were read from the Code. The permitted use section was believed to be overly vague.

Mr. Nicholson observed that one of the permitted uses is tires, sales and service. The Code also allows for other uses. Mr. Bundy commented on concerns with the number of vehicles at the business.
Chair Day questioned whether the request should instead be for a conditional use. Mr. Nicholson responded that the use is not listed as a conditional use in the zone. Mr. Snow commented that the question is whether the proposed use is permitted in the commercial zone. Because one of the permitted uses is athletic and sporting goods stores, the applicant may have a compelling argument that they may be within the leeway of the catchall category to allow other uses as may be determined in harmony with the character, intent, and purpose of the zone.

James Call commented that although he did not like how the current automotive use in the area looks, it is a permitted use. He did not consider what is proposed to be any different and did not think there was a good argument to claim that what is proposed is not a permitted use. Mr. Snow explained that it is ultimately up to the Planning Commission to determine whether the use is in harmony with the intent of the zone. Commissioner Call saw no reason not to allow an RV shop since a tire shop is allowed.

Mr. Rogers stated that the RVs being serviced can be parked behind the building with the work done inside. He remarked that the owners are fastidious about getting the work done quickly. Leina Mathis pointed out that the commercial zone does not include any conditional uses. The existing auto shop was not approved as a conditional use.

Mr. Bundy stated that the matter can be brought back for site plan approval on July 11 if it is the intent of the Planning Commission. The objective tonight was to get feedback from the Commission on what they feel is in harmony with Santa Clara Drive. Procedural issues were discussed. Informally the request seemed to be received favorably. Mr. Rogers stated that their intent was to make the use a positive addition to the City. James Call suggested the applicants listen to feedback from staff.

6. Approval of Minutes.

A. Request Approval of May 9, 2019 Regular Meeting Minutes.

Commissioner Mathis moved to approve the minutes of the May 9, 2019 Regular Meeting, as written. Commissioner Lindsey seconded the motion. The motion passed with the unanimous consent of the Commission.

7. Adjournment.

The Planning Commission Meeting adjourned at approximately 7:46 p.m.

________________________________________
Corey Bundy
Community Development Director

Approved: July 11, 2019